

Appeals Mechanism in International Investment Disputes

Karl P. Sauvant, Editor



Appeals Mechanism in International Investment Disputes

Edited by

Karl P. Sauvant

*Columbia Program on International Investment,
Columbia Law School*

with

Michael Chiswick-Patterson

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

*Oxford University Press, Inc., publishes works that further Oxford University's
objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education.*

Copyright © 2008 by Oxford University Press, Inc.
Published by Oxford University Press, Inc.
198 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press
Oceana is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a
retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic,
mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior
permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.

Library of Congress Control Number:

Appeals mechanism in international investment disputes / edited by Karl P. Sauvant.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN: 978-0-19-534156-0 (alk. paper) 1. Investments, Foreign (International law) 2. Dispute
resolution (Law) 3. Arbitration and award, International. I. Sauvant, Karl P.

K3830.A64 2008

346.07--dc22

2007050084

Note to Readers:

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is based upon sources believed to be accurate and reliable and is intended to be current as of the time it was written. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional person should be sought. Also, to confirm that the information has not been affected or changed by recent developments, traditional legal research techniques should be used, including checking primary sources where appropriate.

*(Based on the Declaration of Principles jointly adopted by a Committee of the
American Bar Association and a Committee of Publishers and Associations.)*

**You may order this or any other Oxford University Press publication
by visiting the Oxford University Press website at www.oup.com**

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Contributors	xi
Participating Institutions	xix
Foreword: Jeffrey D. Sachs	xxi
Preface: David M. Schizer	xxiii

PART I: INTRODUCTION

1 The Rise of International Investment, Investment Agreements and Investment Disputes	3
<i>Karl P. Sauvant</i>	
2 The Multifaceted Nature of International Investment Law	17
<i>Rainer Geiger</i>	
3 Implications for the Future of International Investment Law ..	29
<i>José E. Alvarez</i>	

PART II: RECENT TRENDS IN INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW AND DISPUTES

4 A Coming Crisis: Expansionary Trends in Investment Treaty Arbitration	39
<i>M. Sornarajah</i>	
5 Variation in the Substantive Provisions and Interpretation of International Investment Agreements	81
<i>Patrick Juillard</i>	
6 Explaining the Increased Recourse to Treaty-Based Investment Dispute Settlement	105
<i>Jeswald W. Salacuse</i>	

CONTENTS

Commentary:

- 7 **The Proliferation of BITs: Conflicts of Treaties, Proceedings and Awards** 127
Giorgio Sacerdoti
- 8 **The Growing Diversity and Inconsistency in the IIA System.** . 137
Anna Joubin-Bret

PART III: PROMOTING CONSISTENCY AND COHERENCE

- 9 **Challenges Facing Investment Disputes: Reconsidering Dispute Resolution in International Investment Agreements** 143
Susan D. Franck
- 10 **Transparency in International Dispute Settlement Proceedings on Trade and Investment** 193
Hugo Perezcano Díaz
- 11 **Provisions in the New Generation of U.S. Investment Agreements to Achieve Transparency and Coherence in Investor-State Dispute Settlement** 201
Michael K. Tracton
- 12 **Preliminary Rulings in Investment Arbitration** 207
Christoph Schreuer

Commentary:

- 13 **Transparency and Consistency in International Investment Law: Can the Problems Be Fixed by Tinkering?**..... 213
Howard Mann
- 14 **Improving the System of Investor-State Dispute Settlement: The OECD Governments' Perspective** 223
Katia Yannaca-Small

PART IV: CRITICAL VIEWS ON AN APPELLATE MECHANISM IN INVESTMENT DISPUTES

- 15 Options to Establish an Appellate Mechanism for
Investment Disputes 231
Barton Legum
- 16 Is an Investment Dispute Appellate Mechanism
Desirable? 241
Jan Paulsson
- 17 Implications of an Appellate Body for Investment Disputes
from a Developing Country Point of View..... 267
Asif H. Qureshi & Shandana Gulzar Khan

PART V: REPORT TO THE SYMPOSIUM

- 18 Examining the Institutional Design of International
Investment Law..... 281
Christopher Brummer
- Bibliography*..... 289
Brian J. Rapier

APPENDIX

- 1 Selection of BITs and FTAs with Provisions Relating to an
Appellate Review Mechanism 301
- 2 ICSID Convention, Excerpts 319
- 3 ICSID, “Possible Improvements of the Framework for ICSID
Arbitration,” 22 October 2004 321
- 4 ICSID, “Suggested Changes to the ICSID Rules and
Regulations,” 12 May 2005 339

CONTENTS

**5 International Institute for Sustainable Development,
“Comments on ICSID Discussion Paper ‘Possible
Improvements of the Framework for ICSID
Arbitration,’” December 2004 353**

**6 UNCTAD, “Latest Developments in Investor-State Dispute
Settlement,” IIA Monitor, No. 4 (2005) 377**

**7 UNCTAD, “Latest Developments in Investor-State Dispute
Settlement,” IIA Monitor, No. 4 (2006) 391**

**8 OECD, “Novel Features in OECD Countries’ Recent
Investment Agreements: An Overview,”
12 December 2005 411**